

Spent Fuel and Waste Science and Technology (SFWST)









Argillite Host Rock: Disposal Concepts and Research & Development Activities

Nuclear Waste Technical Review Board Fall 2020 Board Meeting December 2 and 3, 2020 Online Virtual Meeting

Carlos F. Jové Colón Sandia National Laboratories (SNL) SAND2020-13133 PE



Sandia National Laboratories is a multimissio laboratory managed and operated by Nationa Fechnology & Engineering Solutions of Sandia LLC, a wholly owned subsidiary of Honeywel International Inc., for the U.S. Department of Energy's National Nuclear Security

Outline

- Argillite Repository Concept
- Argillaceous Host Rock Characteristics
- Argillite Post-Closure Safety Strategy
- Waste Form and Engineered Barrier in Argillite
- Argillite Reference Case
- Knowledge Gaps & R&D Priorities
- Repository Relevant Processes
- Highlights Disposal in Argillite R&D
- Summary

Argillite Repository Concept



High-Level radioactive waste disposal (ANDRA) – **COx Argillite** (Bildstein and Claret 2015)

U/G = Underground ILW = Intermediate Level Waste HLW = High Level Waste SF = Spent Fuel



Emplacement tunnel (SF/HLW)

Emplacement tunnel (ILW)

Swiss repository concept (Delage et al. 2010) - **Opalinus Clay**



Belgian repository concept- HADES Underground Laboratory – **Boom Clay** (https://science.sckcen.be/en/Facilities/HADES)

Argillite Host Rock Characteristics

- Low permeability
- Low hydraulic gradients
- Low diffusion coefficients
- Good sorption capacity
- Widespread geologic occurrence
- Appropriate thickness and depth for nuclear waste disposal concepts
- Found in stable geologic settings
- Self-sealing properties

Bulk mineralogy: illitic clay, quartz, kaolinite, chlorite, some carbonate; minor feldspar, and pyrite



Porewater Chemistry in Argillaceous Formations



5

- Porewater compositions are highly variable
- Overall: Sodium chloride brines with some calcium and carbonate

Sources: United States Geological Survey (USGS) produced water (Blondes et al. 2018); NATCARB (Bauer et al. 2018); WATSTORE (von Damm 1987)

Argillite Post-Closure Safety Strategy

- Containment
 - Waste package is isolated by depth
 - Protected by buffer/backfill
 - Diffusion-dominated
 - Reducing conditions
 - Overpack integrity (100 yr to >10,000 yr)
- Limited Release
 - Fuel degradation / corrosion is slow in reducing environment
 - Highly effective retardation in host rock due to
 - Low permeability
 - Low effective diffusion coefficient
 - High sorption capacity



Generic stratigraphic column for argillite reference case (Sevougian et al. 2019)

Waste Form and Engineered Barrier in Argillite

- Glass High-Level Waste
 - Vitrified glass log in waste package
 - Horizontal emplacement boreholes
 - Bentonite buffer
- Spent nuclear fuel (SNF) in 4-PWR waste package
 - Horizontal emplacement boreholes
 - With or without bentonite buffer
- SNF in 12-PWR waste package
 - In-drift axial emplacement
 - Bentonite buffer with or without additives
- SNF in 21-PWR to 37-PWR waste package
 - In-drift axial emplacement
 - Bentonite buffer with additives or crushed rock backfill
 - 4 kW per waste package thermal power limit







Jove Colon et al. 2014; Mariner et al. 2017; Sevougian et al. 2019; Stein et al. 2017; 2020

PWR = pressurized water reactor (assembly); represents waste package capacity

Argillite Reference Case: Deterministic Simulations of Generic Disposal in Argillite



Simulation temperature for 24-PWR heat source

Sevougian et al. (2019)

2019 Roadmap Update: High Impact Topic Groups with High and Medium-High Priority R&D Activities Scores

	High Impact R&D Topics	High-Priority R&D Activities	Medium-High-Priority R&D Activities
	High Temperature Impacts	D-1, D-4, I-4, I-6, I-16*, E-11, S-5	I-2, I-3, I-7, E-10
	Buffer and Seal Studies	I-4, E-9, E-17*, A-8, C-15*	I-2, I-3, I-7, A-4, C-6, C-8, C-11
	Coupled Processes (Salt)	S-1, S-3, S-4, I-12, I-13	I-14, S-2, S-7, S-8, S-11*
	Gas Flow in the EBS	I-6, I-8, I-18*	I-9, P-17*
	Criticality	D-1, D-3, D-4, D-5	
	Waste Package Degradation	C-16*, P-12	E-4*, E-6
	In-Package Chemistry	E-14*	E-2, E-20, P-15*, P-16*
-	Generic PA Models		P-1, P-2, P-4, P-11*, P-13*, P-14
	Radionuclide Transport		C-11*, C-13*, C-14*, P-15*, P-16*
	DFN Issues		I-21*, C-1, C-17*
	GDSA Geologic Modeling		O-2, O-3
	THC Processes in EBS		E-3

Activity Designator Legend:

A – Argillite

C – Crystalline

- E Engineered Barrier System I International
- * indicates Gap Activity

- D Dual Purpose Canisters
- P Performance Assessment

S – Salt

O – Other

2019 Roadmap Update: High-Priority R&D Activities

	High Priority R&D Activities							
	A-08	Evaluation of ordinary Portland cement (OPC)						
	C-15*	Design improved backfill and seal materials						
	C-16*	Development of new waste package concepts and models for evaluation of waste package performance for long-term disposal						
	D-01	Probabilistic post-closure DPC criticality consequence analyses Task 1 - Scoping Phase Task 2 - Preliminary Analysis Phase Task 3 - Development Phase						
	D-03	DPC filler and neutron absorber degradation testing and analysis						
	D-04	Coupled multi-physics simulation of DPC postclosure (chemical, mechanical, thermal-hydraulic) including processes external to the waste package.						
	D-05	Source term development with and without criticality						
	E-09	Cement plug/liner degradation						
•	E-11	EBS High Temp experimental data collection To evaluate high temperature mineralogy /geochemistry changes.						
	E-14*	In-Package Chemistry						
	E-17*	Buffer Material by Design						

High Priority R&D Activities						
I-04	Experiment of bentonite EBS under high temperature, HotBENT					
I-06	Mont Terri FS Fault Slip Experiment					
I-08	DECOVALEX-2019 Task A: Advective gas flow in bentonite					
I-12	TH and THM Processes in Salt: German-US Collaborations (WEIMOS)					
I-13	TH and THM Processes in Salt: German-US Collaborations (BENVASIM)					
I-16*	New Activity: DECOVALEX Task on Salt Heater Test and Coupled Modeling					
I-18*	New Activity: Other potential DECOVALEX Tasks of Interest: Large-Scale Gas Transport					
P-12	WP Degradation Model Framework					
S-01	Salt Coupled THM processes, hydraulic properties from mechanical behavior (geomechanical)					
S-03	Coupled THC advection and diffusion processes in Salt, multi-phase flow processes and material properties in Salt					
S-04	Coupled THC processes in Salt, Dissolution and precipitation of salt near heat sources (heat pipes)					
S-05	Borehole-based Field Testing in Salt					

Activity Designator Legend:

А	_	Aı	rai	ite
•••			J.	

- C Crystalline
- S Salt
- D Dual Purpose Canisters
- E Engineered Barrier System
- I International
- O Other
- P Performance Assessment
- * indicates Gap Activity

High Priority Argillite Activities

#	Description	Purpose	Crosscut	SFWST Argillite R&D Activity	Int'l Tie-in
A-08 E-09 C-15	Evaluation of Ordinary Portland Cement (OPC) Cement plug/liner degradation Design improved backfill and seal materials	Evaluation of mineralogical alteration evolution in seals and liners	Crystalline, Engineered Barrier System (EBS)	Experimentally verified cement-geomaterial 3D reactive transport model development in PFLOTRAN Experimental studies of barrier material interactions (cement-bentonite-metal)	DECOVALEX2019 – Task C EBS Task Force – Cement Task
E-11 E-17	EBS High Temperature Geochemistry/ Mineralogy Buffer Material by Design	Evaluation of mineralogical alteration at buffer/waste package interface	Crystalline, Engineered Barrier System (EBS)	Hydrothermal experiments evaluating host rock, buffer, buffer additives, and canister materials interactions at elevated temperatures	HotBENT

High Priority Argillite Activities (cont.)

#	Description	Purpose	Crosscut	SFWST Argillite Activity	Int'l Tie-in
I-06 I-08	Mont Terri Fault Slip Experiment Advective gas flow in bentonite	Evaluation of transport effects and evolution in seals, and bentonite backfill	Crystalline, Engineered Barrier System (EBS)	Fault activation and self-sealing in argillite Multiphase flow bentonite Studies at various scales	 DECOVALEX 2019 - Mont Terri Fault Slip Experiment DECOVALEX 2023 Task B: Modeling Gas Advection in Clay (MAGIC) Task C, D: THMC Modeling, Heater Test Experiments
I-04 E-14	Experiments of Bentonite under High Temperature In-Package Chemistry (Gap Activity)	Evaluation of barrier alteration, transport, & chemical effects in backfill & canister materials	Crystalline	Benchtop High Temp Bentonite Column Test & modeling In-package material interactions modeling & experiments	HotBENT Column Test, EBS Task Force -

Repository Phases and Relevant Processes: Cross-Cuts With International Partnerships



	Key R&D Issues			
	Near-Field Perturbation			
	Engineered Barrier Integrity			
	Flow and Radionuclide Transport			
	Demonstration of Integrated System Behavior			
Fu	III-scale Emplacement Experir	ment (France)		
Heated Brine Availability Test in Salt (USA)				
B	entonite Rock Interaction Exp	eriment (Swe		

BRIE = Bentonite Rock Interaction Experiment (Sweden) FEBEX = Full-Scale Engineered Barrier Exp. (Switzerland) CFM = Colloid Formation Migration (Switzerland) FE = Full-scale Emplacement Experiment (Switzerland) HE-E = Heater Experiment in Micro-tunnel (Switzerland) HotBent = High-Temperature Heater Test (Switzerland) HLW = High Level Waste

LTDE = Long-Term Diffusion Sorption Experiment (Sweden) TED = Thermal Experiment (France)

DECOVALEX = DEvelopment of COupled Models and their VALidation Against EXperiments

Highlights – Disposal in Argillite R&D

- High temperature experiments of bentonite interactions with barrier materials and host rocks: granodiorite & Opalinus Clay
- **Development of a preliminary GDSA reference case** for disposal in argillite media
- Advances in Thermo-Hydrological-Mechanical (THMC) modeling approaches of bentonite barrier, argillite rock, and excavated disturbed zone (EDZ fracture/damage behavior) & gas migration
- **Thermodynamic modeling** of bentonite barrier material interactions & thermodynamic database development
- Non-isothermal 1D-3D Thermo-Hydrological-Chemical (THC) reactive transport modeling
- International collaborations:
 - DECOVALEX19: PFLOTRAN Hydrological- Chemical (HC) modeling of barrier interactions
 - DECOVALEX2023: Gas transport in clays, TH modeling (just started!)



Continuum model approach using TOUGH-FLAC

Discrete fracture model approach using TOUGH-RBSN



Past Experiments: Steel – Clay Interactions



- Experiment
 - T = 300°C; STRIPA brine
 - Wyoming Bentonite
 - 316 & 304 stainless steel (SS)



- Corrosion products
 - Uniform corrosion (no pitting)
 - Chromite passivation layer
 - Fe-rich smectite (Fe-saponite), Chlorite
 - Pentlandite (Fe,Ni)₉S₈
 - Millerite (NiS)



Pourbaix diagram Thermodynamic modeling and database development

Cheshire et al. 2014, 2018

Barrier Material Interactions: Bulk Mineralogy Changes

Opalinus Clay ± Wyoming Bentonite

- Quantitative X-ray diffraction (Q-XRD) of experimental run products
- 300°C (6 months): Zeolite formation in clay and along cracks and edges on the Opalinus Clay fragments, plagioclase
- 200°C (8 weeks): No zeolites or feldspar
- Both: wt.% clay increases
- Opalinus Clay + Wyoming Bentonite + Portland Cement
 - Formation of calcium-silicate-hydrate (CSH) minerals, zeolites, plagioclase feldspar at 200°C
 - Clay degradation
 - Reduction in clay swelling
 - Amorphous material (gel?)

Sauer et al. (2019)





Thermo-Hydrological-Mechanical (THM) Processes in Clay Underground Research Laboratory Experiments and Simulation



SFW<u>ST</u>

Non-isothermal 1D-3D Thermo-Hydrological-Chemical (THC) Reactive Transport Modeling



- Waste canister length: 4.7 m
- 12 PWR assemblies
- 50-year storage time

Evaluation of thermal effects on fluid/solid interactions

- Chemical reactions mineral dissolution/precipitation
- Changes in bulk mineralogy
- Evaluate changes in porosity/permeability
- Next: Evaluate THC scenarios with higher thermal loads (24-PWR and 37-PWR).
- Next: Evaluate mesh resolution
 effects

FEBEX-DP - Thermal Analysis: Thermogravimetric Analysis (TGA) & Differential Scanning Calorimetry (DSC) - Controlled Relative Humidity (RH) & Temperature



Bentonite Thermal Behavior

- Bentonite dehydration behavior is a function of the duration of hydration that precedes it.
- Appearance of a "shoulder peak" during dehydration indicating different energetics for swelling clay hydration and dehydration.
- Cyclical thermal analysis methodology will be used in the study of additives to bentonite.
- NEXT: Conduct thermal studies at temperatures above 100°C

DECOVALEX19: GREET Experiment at Mizunami Underground Research Laboratory Site (Japan) – Closure Test Drift (CTD) Geochemistry



DECOVALEX19: PFLOTRAN 3D Reactive Transport (RT) Model of GREET URL Experiment (Mizunami Site, Japan)



- Sensitivity analyses (SA) on kinetic rate law parameters for various cement phases and volume fraction of mineral components
- Simulations have been conducted to evaluate the effect of shotcrete thickness effects
 Jové Colón et al. (2020)

25 m

13MI39

13MI43

13MI42

Impervious plug

Summary

- Development of a high temperature argillite reference case
 - Need to further disposal concepts for DPC's, EBS design options (e.g., thermal management), and post-closure strategies
- Bentonite-metal-cement-Opalinus Clay interactions:
 - Reactions produces zeolites and with some swelling reduction in smectite as a result of interactions with alkaline solutions
 - Future Work: Study effects of host rock composition & other barrier materials (e.g. cement); expand 3D non-isothermal model to various waste packages
- DECOVALEX Hydrological-Cchemical (HC) (GREET) modeling and Thermal Analyses on FEBEX-DP Bentonite:
 - 3D reactive transport model of shotcrete interactions in CTD experiment represent overall chemical trends
 - Cyclic thermal analysis (hydration/dehydration) experiments show reproducible results between cycles with slower dehydration rates
 - Future Work: Investigate HC model sensitivities to shotcrete thickness; expand cyclic thermal analyses & XRD methods to evaluate high temperature effects; maintain engagement with international programs (DECOVALEX2023; HotBent, EBS Task Force)

Acknowledgements

 C. Payne (SNL), J. Kruichak (SNL), M. Mills (SNL), A. Knight (SNL), H. Moffat (SNL), E. Coker (SNL), T. Ho (SNL), Y. Wang (SNL), E. Stein (SNL), S. David Sevougian (SNL), F. Perry (SNL), C. M. Lopez (SNL), F. Caporuscio (LANL), K. Sauer (LANL), M. Rock (LANL), M. Cheshire (LANL), J. Rutqvist (LBNL), L. Zheng (LBNL)







References

- Bauer, J., Rowan, C., Barkhurst, A., Digiulio, J., Jones, K., Sabbatino, M., Rose, K. and Wingo, P. (2018) NATCARB. National Energy Technology Laboratory-Energy Data eXchange; NETL, United States (doi:10.18141/1474110).
- Bildstein, O. and Claret, F. (2015) Stability of clay barriers under chemical perturbations, Developments in Clay Science. Elsevier, pp. 155-188.
- Blondes, M.S., Gans, K.D., Engle, M.A., Kharaka, Y.K., Reidy, M.E., Saraswathula, V., Thordsen, J.J., Rowan, E.L. and Morrissey, E.A. (2018) U.S. Geological Survey National Produced
 Waters Geochemical Database (ver. 2.3, January 2018), U.S. Geological Survey data release. U.S. Geological Survey Reston, VA; https://doi.org/10.5066/F7J964W8.
- Bourg, I.C. (2015) Sealing shales versus brittle shales: a sharp threshold in the material properties and energy technology uses of fine-grained sedimentary rocks. Environmental Science & Technology Letters 2, 255-259.
- Cheshire, M., Caporuscio, F.A., Rearick, M.S., Jové Colón, C.F. and McCarney, M.K. (2014) Bentonite evolution at elevated pressures and temperatures: An experimental study for generic nuclear repository designs. Am Mineral 99, 1662-1675.
- Cheshire, M.C., Caporuscio, F.A., Jové Colón, C.F. and Norskog, K.E. (2018) Fe-saponite growth on low-carbon and stainless steel in hydrothermal-bentonite experiments. J Nucl Mater 511, 353-366.
- Delage, P., Cui, Y.J. and Tang, A.M. (2010) Clays in radioactive waste disposal. Journal of Rock Mechanics and Geotechnical Engineering 2, 111-123.
- Ho, T.A. and Jové Colón, C.F. (2019) Non-isothermal Multiphase 3D Reactive Transport Modeling of an Engineered Barrier System in Clay Rock (SAND2019-5514 PE), Spent Fuel and Waste Disposition, Annual Working Group Meeting, Las Vegas, Nevada. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM USA.
- Jove Colon, C.F., Payne, C., Knight, A., Moffat, H., Coker, E., Caporuscio, F., Sauer, K., Cheshire, M., 2019, Disposal in Argillite R&D Work Package: Introduction & Key Accomplishments; Spent Fuel and Waste Disposition Annual Working Group Meeting, Las Vegas, Nevada, May 21-23; SAND2019-5596 PE.
- Jové Colón, C.F., Ho, T.A., Coker, E., Weck, P., Hadgu, T., Kalinina, E.A., Lopez, C.M., Sanchez, et al. (2020) Evaluation of Nuclear Spent Fuel Disposal in Clay-Bearing Rock Process Model Development and Experimental Studies, Spent Fuel Waste Science and Technology, M2SF-20SN010301051. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, New Mexico USA, 551 pp.
- Madsen, F.T. and Müller-Vonmoos, M. (1989) The swelling behaviour of clays. Appl Clay Sci 4, 143-156.
- Rutqvist, J., Guglielmi, Y., Xu, H., Zarzycki, P., Deng, H., Li, P., Hu, M., Nico, P., Borglin, S., Fox, P.M., Sasaki, T. and Birkholzer, J. (2020) Investigation of Coupled Processes in Argillite Rock: FY20 Progress (LBNL-2001324), Spent Fuel and Waste Disposition. Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory, Berkeley, CA USA, 206 pp.
- Sauer, K., Caporuscio, F.A., Rock, M.J. and Jové Colón, C.F. (2019) Hydrothermal interaction of Wyoming Bentonite and Opalinus Clay (LA-UR-19-24523), Spent Fuel and Waste Disposition Annual Working Group Meeting. Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, New Mexico USA.
- Sellin, P. and Leupin, O.X. (2013) The Use of Clay as an Engineered Barrier in Radioactive-Waste Management A Review. Clay Clay Miner 61, 477-498.
- Sevougian, D., Stein, E.R., LaForce, T., Perry, F.V., Nole, M. and Chang, K.W. (2019) GDSA Repository Systems Analysis FY19 Update, U.S. Department of Energy Spent Fuel and Waste Science and Technology Campaign. Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM USA.
- Stein, E., Mariner, P., Hammond, G., Frederick, J., and Sevougian, S.D., Generic Disposal System Analysis: Argillite Reference Case and Performance Assessment, 2017 SWSFT Annual Working Group Meeting; May 24, 2017; SAND2017-5450 PE.
- Stein, E.R., Bryan, C.R., Dobson, D.C., Hardin, E.L., Jové Colón, C.F., Lopez, C.M., Matteo, E.N., et al. (2020), Disposal Concepts for a High-Temperature Repository in Shale, Sandia National Laboratories, Albuquerque, NM USA. Report Tracking Number: 1209013, 180 pp.
- von Damm, K.L. (1987) Geochemistry of shale groundwaters: survey of available data and postulated mineralogic controls on composition (Publication No. 2941). Environmental Sciences Division, Oak Ridge National Lab., Oak Ridge, TN, USA.

Disclaimer & Legal Notice

Disclaimer

This is a technical presentation that does not take into account contractual limitations or obligations under the Standard Contract for Disposal of Spent Nuclear Fuel and/or High-Level Radioactive Waste (Standard Contract) (10 CFR Part 961). For example, under the provisions of the Standard Contract, spent nuclear fuel in multi-assembly canisters is not an acceptable waste form, absent a mutually agreed to contract amendment.

To the extent discussions or recommendations in this presentation conflict with the provisions of the Standard Contract, the Standard Contract governs the obligations of the parties, and this presentation in no manner supersedes, overrides, or amends the Standard Contract.

This presentation reflects technical work which could support future decision making by DOE. No inferences should be drawn from this presentation regarding future actions by DOE, which are limited both by the terms of the Standard Contract and Congressional appropriations for the Department to fulfill its obligations under the Nuclear Waste Policy Act including licensing and construction of a spent nuclear fuel repository.

Legal Notice

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by an agency of the United States Government. Neither the United States Government, nor any agency thereof, nor any of their employees, nor any of their contractors, subcontractors, or their employees, make any warranty, express or implied, or assume any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness, or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product, or process disclosed, or represent that its use would not infringe privately owned rights. Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process, or service by trade name, trademark, manufacturer, or otherwise, does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation, or favoring by the United States Government, any agency thereof, or any of their contractors or subcontractors. The views and opinions expressed herein do not necessarily state or reflect those of the United States Government, any agency thereof, or any of their contractors.